

**POLICING IN ABORIGINAL
COMMUNITIES:
THE EVOLUTION, SUCCESSES
AND CHALLENGES**

DON CLAIRMONT

September, 2009



**DALHOUSIE
UNIVERSITY**

**ATLANTIC INSTITUTE
OF CRIMINOLOGY**

OVERVIEW OF PRESENTATION

- 1. KEY FACTORS AND TURNING POINTS IN THE EVOLUTION OF POLICING IN ABORIGINAL COMMUNITIES.**
- 2. PHASES IN POLICING IN FIRST NATIONS.**
- 3. RCMP AND O.P.P. POLICING AND FIRST NATIONS.**
- 4. THE SELF-ADMINISTERED POLICING SERVICES.**
- 5. FROM 1996 TO 2007: FIELD-LEVEL OFFICERS IN FN POLICING.**
- 6. MAJOR CURRENT ISSUES.**
- 7. FUTURE DIRECTIONS.**

CURRENT ISSUES AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS

- INVIGORATING THE “BLOOM OF THE ROSE.”
- CONTINUED EXAMINATION OF THE POLICING STRATEGY IN FIRST NATIONS. (E.G., POLICE ROLE IN SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT?)
- RE-CONCEPTUALIZING THE FNPP (e.g., RETHINKING THE ENHANCEMENT APPROACH) AND ELABORATING THE ROLE OF THE APD.

THREE CENTRAL TURNING POINTS IN SHAPING ABORIGINAL POLICING POLICY

- 1. THE WITHDRAWAL OF THE RCMP FROM REGULAR POLICING OF RESERVES IN ONTARIO AND QUEBEC BEGINNING IN THE 1960'S.**
- 2. DIAND'S 1971 "CIRCULAR 55" POLICY ON POLICING ABORIGINAL COMMUNITIES.**
- 3. THE FEDERAL FIRST NATION POLICING POLICY INTRODUCED IN 1991.**

PHASES IN FIRST NATION POLICING

PHASE ONE: UP TO AND INCLUDING THE 1950s

- FEDERAL POLICING.
- BROAD POLICING MANDATE.
- ABORIGINAL HELPERS.

PHASE TWO: THE 1960s

- THE RCMP BEGIN TO PULL OUT OF ONTARIO AND QUEBEC.
- CONTRACTION OF THE POLICING MANDATE.
- SOME DIRECT ABORIGINAL PARTICIPATION IN POLICING.

PHASES IN FIRST NATION POLICING

PHASE THREE: THE 1970s AND EARLY 1980s

- THE 3B OPTIONS.
- SELF-ADMINISTERED POLICING INITIATIVES.
- NEW GOVERNANCE INITIATIVES. (THE TRIPARTITE AGREEMENT, THE ONTARIO INDIAN POLICE COMMISSION).

PHASE FOUR: THE LATE 1980s TO LATE 1990s

- INQUIRIES AND COMMISSIONS. (eg., HEAD)
- FIRST NATIONS POLICING POLICY.
- ROYAL COMMISSION ON ABORIGINAL PEOPLES. (RCAP)
- THE TRIPARTITE AGREEMENTS / GROWTH OF SELF-ADMINISTERED (SA)FN POLICING.

CURRENT SITUATION

- NEAR-COMplete TRIPARTITE COVERAGE IN FN POLICING.
- INDIGENIZATION EXTENSIVE IN ALL FN POLICING.
- 47 SELF-ADMINISTERED SERVICES.
- CONTINUING DEVELOPMENTS & CONTINUING CHALLENGES.
- ASSESSMENT OF THE EVOLUTION AND PREPARING FOR THE NEXT PHASE.

EVOLUTION OF POLICING IN ABORIGINAL COMMUNITIES: MAJOR FACTORS UNDERLYING CHANGE

- PUBLIC SAFETY ISSUES.
- FN LEADERSHIP AND PROTESTS.
- MACRO CULTURAL CHANGE (CITIZENSHIP PLUS).
- EMPATHY OF POLICE SERVICES AND MAINSTREAM LEADERS.

RCMP POLICING IN FIRST NATIONS

1. THE DUAL TRANSFORMATION IN THE 60s.
2. BAND CONSTABLES AND THE 3B APPROACH.
3. ASS'T COMM HEAD'S CONCLUSION IN 1989.
4. FNPP AND THE CTAs SYSTEM.
5. EMBEDDING AN HISTORIC RELATIONSHIP.
6. CRITICISMS AND NEW DEVELOPMENTS.

THE OPP AND POLICING IN FIRST NATIONS

1. THE TRANSFORMATIVE YEARS 1973-1976.
2. THE INDIAN CONSTABLE PROGRAM.
3. DEALING WITH OCCUPATIONS AND PROTESTS.
4. THE RESPONSE TO THE FNPP.
5. SUPPORTING THE SAs IN ONTARIO.
6. NEED FOR PARTNERSHIPS WITH SAs AND LEADERSHIP AMONG THE MPDs IN ONTARIO.

TYPES OF SELF-ADMINISTERED FN POLICE SERVICES IN CANADA

**1. THE FULL-SERVICE TOWN MODEL:
SIX NATIONS AND AKWESASNE.**

**2. THE NICHE MODEL: WIKWEMIKONG,
HURON-WENDAKE, T'SUU T'INA.**

**3. THE REGIONAL MODEL:
NISHNAWBE-ASKI, ANISHNABEK.**

**4. THE MICRO TRANSITIONAL MODEL:
TIMISKAMING, WHAPMAGOOSTUI.**

WHAT'S GOING ON IN THE FIELD: VOICES OF THE OFFICERS IN FNs

NATIONAL SURVEYS IN 1996 AND 2007

- COMMONALITIES AND DIVERSITY IN RECRUITMENT, TRAINING AND POLICING STYLES.
- THE CHALLENGES OF POLICING ABORIGINAL COMMUNITIES.
- SATISFACTION AND STRESS.
- OFFICERS AND THEIR POLICING SERVICE.
- STABILITY, TURNOVER AND SUGGESTIONS.

RECRUITMENT AND TRAINING: KEY THEMES

- 1. OFFICERS IN 2007 HAD MORE EDUCATION, TRAINING AND POLICING EXPERIENCE THAN OFFICERS IN 1996.**
- 2. SAME MOTIVATIONS FOR POLICING BY DECADE AND BY POLICE SERVICE.**
- 3. RCMP OFFICERS HAD EXTRA TRAINING & SIGNIFICANTLY MORE OPPORTUNITIES TO BE MENTORED, TO SUPERVISE AND MORE HAD 'LEARNING PLANS' THAN SA OFFICERS. NO DIFFERENCES ON ADEQUACY OF TRAINING OR SERVICE'S SUPPORT FOR IT.**
- 4. WITHIN RCMP: LITTLE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN ABORIG AND NON-ABORIG OFFICERS EXCEPT NON-ABORIG OFFICERS HAD MORE ELABORATED TRAINING AND WERE TWICE AS LIKELY TO HAVE 'LEARNING PLANS.' ABORIGINALS WANTED MORE TRAINING IN "PROMOTION-RELATED" SKILLS.**

DOING POLICE WORK – A: “I SPEND A LOT OF TIME AT...”

- OFFICERS IN THE RCMP AND SAs REPORTED SPENDING A LOT OF TIME IN THE SAME ACTIVITIES AS THE 1996 SAMPLE, NAMELY PAPERWORK (BY FAR #1), INVESTIGATION AND ANSWERING CALLS FOR SERVICE.
- RCMP OFFICERS REPORTED A LOT OF TIME IN 1996 AND 2007 ON COURT ACTIVITIES WHILE SAs’ OTHER MAJOR ACTIVITY IN BOTH PERIODS WAS CAR PATROL.
- IN BOTH SERVICES, 2007 SAW AN INCREASE IN ANSWERING CALLS FOR SERVICE AND DEALING WITH MINOR DISPUTES.

DOING POLICE WORK – B: “AN SA STYLE OF POLICING”

- SA STYLE WAS MEASURED BY INFORMAL CONTACT, MEETING LOCAL OFFICIALS, AND ENGAGEMENT IN NON-CRIME-RELATED COMMUNITY ACTIVITIES.
- SA OFFICERS HAD SIGNIFICANTLY HIGHER SCORES ON THIS INDEX THAN RCMP OFFICERS. THERE WERE NO OTHER CORRELATES NOR ANY SIGNIFICANT VARIATION BY ETHNIC IDENTITY WITHIN THE RCMP.
- HIGH SA STYLE SCORES WERE RELATED TO HOLDING THAT ABORIGINAL IDENTITY IS THE KEY TO CULTURALLY APT POLICING AND ALSO TO HOLDING NEGATIVE VIEWS OF THE POLICING ROLE.

DOING POLICE WORK – C: WHAT IS GOOD POLICING?

- OFFICERS WERE ASKED TO AGREE OR DISAGREE WITH STATEMENTS RE “GOOD POLICING” IN 1996 AND 2007. THERE WAS A GENERAL STABILITY IN THEIR RESPONSES AND MUCH AGREEMENT BY POLICE SERVICE.
- THE ONLY REPORTED TREND WAS FOR OFFICERS, RCMP AND SAs, TO AGREE MORE IN 2007 THAN IN 1996 ON THE VALUE OF A BASIC POLICING FOCUS AND LESS ON THE VALUE OF DEALING WITH THE “LESS IMPORTANT PROBLEMS OF CITIZENS”.

DOING POLICE WORK – D: PREFERRED APPROACH TO POLICING

- ATTITUDINAL INDEXES OF AN ENFORCEMENT MODEL AND A SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT MODEL WERE CREATED.
- HIGH SCORES FOR THE SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT MODEL WERE GIVEN BY SAs MORE THAN BY RCMP OFFICERS, WITHIN THE RCMP MORE BY ABORIGINAL OFFICERS THAN NON-ABORIGINAL, AND MORE BY OFFICERS RAISED IN AN ABORIGINAL FAMILY THAN OTHERS.
- THE ENFORCEMENT MODEL WAS EMPHASIZED BY OFFICERS WHO WERE YOUNG, MALE, CONSTABLE RANK, AND NON-ABORIGINAL.

DOING POLICE WORK – E: HOW TO DO POLICING IN ABORIGINAL COMMUNITIES

- ABOUT 70% OF THE OFFICERS, BOTH RCMP AND SAs, AGREED IN 1996 THAT “MY STYLE OF POLICING IS DIFFERENT FROM THAT IN NON-ABORIGINAL COMMUNITIES”. THERE WAS A DECLINE IN BOTH SERVICES IN 2007, MARGINAL AMONG THE SAs BUT MORE AMONG RCMP. (to 54%)
- THERE WAS MUCH AGREEMENT TOO, AMONG ALL OFFICERS ABOUT WHAT IS IMPORTANT TO DO IN POLICING ABORIGINAL COMMUNITIES.
- THERE WAS SIGNIFICANT DISAGREEMENT RE HOW ONE BECOMES CAPABLE OF CULTURALLY APPROPRIATE POLICING: NON-ABORIGINALS HELD THE VIEW THAT ONE CAN LEARN HOW TO DO SO IN TRAINING, WHILE ABORIGINALS, THOUGH VALUING SUCH TRAINING, EMPHASIZED MORE HAVING ABORIGINAL IDENTITY AND LIFE EXPERIENCE.

CHALLENGES FOR POLICING – A:

- **TOP THREE “BIG PROBLEMS” FOR POLICING BY YEAR AND BY POLICE SERVICE**
 - TWO OF THREE WERE COMMON IN BOTH YEARS, FOR BOTH RCMP AND SAs: “UNSOLVABLE SOCIAL PROBLEMS” AND “LACK OF BACK-UP.”
 - RCMP 3RD IN BOTH YEARS WAS “UNREASONABLE EXPECTATIONS FROM THE POLICE ORGANIZATION.”
 - SAs 3RD IN 1996 WAS “LACK OF POLICING PROGRAMS AND MATERIALS TO DO THE JOB” BUT IN 2007 THE 3RD WAS “COMMUNITY MISTRUST OF POLICE.”

CHALLENGES FOR POLICING – B:

- **“HAVING TO DEAL WITH MOSTLY UNSOLVABLE SOCIAL PROBLEMS”**
 - THE HIGHEST % RE “SOMEWHAT” OR “BIG” PROBLEMS IN BOTH 1996 (80%), 2007 (86%).
 - THE ONLY ONE OF 12 COMMON ITEMS ELICITING A DIFFERENT LEVEL OF RESPONSE IN 2007 THAN IN 1996. (38% NOW SAY ‘BIG PROBLEM’ BUT ONLY 25% IN 1996)
 - BOTH RCMP AND SA OFFICERS EXHIBIT THIS INCREASE FROM 1996 TO 2007.
 - (RCMP FROM 30% TO 45% & SAs FROM 24% TO 31%.)

CHALLENGES FOR POLICING – C:

- **TOP THREE PERCEIVED PROBLEM AREAS WHERE RCMP AND SAs DIFFERED MOST:**
 - INTIMIDATION BY LOCAL RESIDENTS.
(RCMP 25 % , SAs 45%)
 - INTIMIDATION OF FAMILY BY LOCALS.
(RCMP 22%, SAs 42%)
 - THE IMBALANCE BETWEEN PAPERWORK AND POLICING. (RCMP 83%, SAs 65%)

CHALLENGES FOR POLICING – D:

- **THREE TRENDS**

- RCMP: NO SIGNIFICANT DECLINE IN “BIG” PROBLEMS BUT ONLY “DEALING WITH UNSOLVABLE SOCIAL PROBLEMS” SIGNIFICANTLY INCREASED IN 2007.
- RCMP: LITTLE DIFFERENCE IN ASSESSMENTS BETWEEN ABORIGINAL AND NON-ABORIGINAL OFFICERS.
- SAs: HIGHER % PERCEIVING “BIG” PROBLEM IN 2007 ESPECIALLY FOR “UNSOLVABLE SOCIAL PROBLEMS” AND INAPPROPRIATE COMMUNITY EXPECTATIONS.

COMMUNITY PROBLEMS: A

MAIN THEME

LITTLE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN RCMP AND SAs OR BETWEEN ABORIGINAL AND NON-ABORIGINAL OFFICERS OR BY GENDER
RE FOUR TOP COMMUNITY PROBLEMS,
SAFETY IN THE COMMUNITY OR
QUALITY OF RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN
POLICE SERVICE AND RESIDENTS.

COMMUNITY PROBLEMS: B

- **TOP FOUR RATED “VERY SERIOUS” BY POLICE SERVICE**
 - **ALCOHOL & DRUG PROBLEMS.**
(RCMP 78%, SAs 71%)
 - **FAMILY PROBLEMS.** (RCMP 55%, SAs 47%)
 - **CHILD WELFARE.** (RCMP 52%, SAs 41%)
 - **POVERTY & UNEMPLOYMENT.** (RCMP 51%, SAs 39%)

HOW SAFE IS THE COMMUNITY?

- OFFICERS' VIEWS AND THEIR PERCEPTION OF COMMUNITY VIEWS RE HOW UNSAFE THE RESIDENTS IN THEIR POLICING AREA WERE WITH RESPECT TO SIX ITEMS.

| Item | % Unsafe Officer's View | % Unsafe Resident's View* |
|-----------------------------|--------------------------------|----------------------------------|
| Public disorder | 22% | 33% |
| Assaults | 51% | 59% |
| Property crime | 61% | 69% |
| Gang activity | 33% | 41% |
| Drug-related crime | 64% | 72% |
| Illegal use firearms | 43% | 46% |

*** As perceived by the officers in the sample**

COMMUNITY– POLICE RELATIONSHIP

| RATING THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE POLICE SERVICE AND THE COMMUNITY RESIDENTS | RCMP (N= 151) | SA OFFICERS (N=133) |
|---|--------------------------|------------------------------------|
| EXCELLENT | 8% | 6% |
| GOOD | 52% | 50% |
| FAIR | 30% | 35% |
| POOR | 10% | 9% |

SATISFACTION AND STRESS

- **HIGH LEVELS OF JOB SATISFACTION AND BELIEF THAT THEIR POLICING CAN CONTRIBUTE TO FN PROGRESS.**
- **STABILITY OVER THE DECADE BUT SOME CHANGES – IMPACT ON ABORIGINAL JUSTICE BECOMES LESS IMPORTANT AS A FACTOR.**
- **KEY FACTORS IMPACTING ON JOB SATISFACTION: AGE, RANK, APPROACH TO POLICING.**
- **ORGANIZATIONAL LIMITATIONS & COMMUNITY PROBLEMS IMPACT ON JOB STRESS.**

OFFICERS AND THE POLICE SERVICE

- HIGH REGARD FOR THEIR POLICING SERVICE AMONG BOTH RCMP AND SAs.
- STABILITY OF ORGANIZATIONAL ASSESSMENTS BUT SOME SIGNIFICANT CHANGES OVER THE DECADE.
- THE ISSUES OF ORGANIZATIONAL DISSATISFACTION VARY BY POLICE SERVICE AND ABORIGINAL IDENTITY.
- PERCEIVED ORGANIZATIONAL LIMITATIONS RE OFFICERS' CAREER PROSPECTS VARY IN THE SAME WAYS.

STABILITY AND TURNOVER: HOPE AND EXPECTATIONS

- **EXPECT TO BE THERE 5 YEARS LATER?**
 - OVERALL SAMPLE: YES 63%, MAYBE/NO 37%
 - 40 OR YOUNGER: YES 74%, MAYBE/NO 26%

- **HOPE TO BE THERE 5 YEARS LATER?**
 - OVERALL SAMPLE: YES 55%, MAYBE/NO 45%
 - 40 OR YOUNGER: YES 56%, MAYBE/NO 44%

STABILITY AND TURNOVER AMONG OFFICERS 40 OR YOUNGER

| EXPECTATIONS AND HOPES BEING THERE 5 YEARS LATER | | RCMP – NON ABORIG. | RCMP - ABORIG. | SA OFFICERS |
|---|-----------------------|-----------------------------------|---------------------------|------------------------|
| EXPECTATION | YES | 95% | 83% | 57% |
| | MAYBE / NO | 5% | 17% | 43% |
| HOPE | YES | 81% | 68% | 37% |
| | MAYBE / NO | 19% | 32% | 63% |

KEY FACTORS RELATED TO POSSIBLE TURNOVER AMONG OFFICERS 40 YEARS OR YOUNGER

- **PERCEIVED ORGANIZATIONAL LIMITATIONS (POL)**
 - IF POL HIGH, ONLY 21% EXPECT TO BE THERE AND ONLY 32% HOPE TO BE THERE.
- **REPORTED ORGANIZATIONAL SATISFACTION (ROS)**
 - IF ROS HIGH, 61% EXPECT TO BE THERE BUT IF ROS LOW, THE % DROPS TO 26%.
- **REPORTED ORGANIZATIONAL DISSATISFACTION (ROD)**
 - IF ROD HIGH, ONLY 34% EXPECT TO BE THERE.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS OF TURNOVER PROSPECTS

- **SERIOUS TURNOVER ISSUES FOR SAs.**
- **DIFFERENT POLICY IMPERATIVES.**
 - FOR SAs: DEALING WITH ORG SIZE, EXTRINSIC JOB SATISFACTION AND LONG-TERM SECURITY OF POLICE SERVICE.
 - RCMP: SHARP DIFFERENCES BY ABORIGINAL / NON-ABORIGINAL IDENTITY REQUIRE EXAMINATION (LEARNING DEVELOPMENT PLANS).

OFFICERS' SUGGESTIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT IN THEIR POLICING AND IN COMMUNITY ASSESSMENTS

- **THEIR OWN POLICING EFFECTIVENESS**
 - **TOP TWO IN 2007 WERE (SA > RCMP)**
 - BETTER COMPENSATION & PROMOTION OPPORTUNITIES.
 - INTRODUCE DIFFERENT ORGANIZATIONAL POLICIES AND PRACTICES.
 - **CHANGE FROM 1996 WHEN TOP TWO WERE**
 - MORE AND BETTER TRAINING.
 - MORE RESOURCES INCLUDING COMPLEMENT AND MANPOWER.

OFFICERS' SUGGESTIONS FOR IMPROVEMENT IN THEIR POLICING AND IN COMMUNITY ASSESSMENTS

- **TO IMPROVE THE COMMUNITY'S ASSESSMENTS.**
 - **TOP THREE IN BOTH 1996 AND 2007 WERE:**
 - **DO MORE COMMUNITY POLICING.**
 - **DO MORE PROACTIVE POLICING.**
 - **EDUCATE LEADERS AND OTHERS MORE ABOUT THE POLICE ROLE.**

CURRENT ISSUES AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS

- INVIGORATING THE “BLOOM OF THE ROSE.”
- CONTINUED EXAMINATION OF THE POLICING STRATEGY IN FIRST NATIONS. (E.G., POLICE ROLE IN SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT?)
- RE-CONCEPTUALIZING THE FNPP (e.g., RETHINKING THE ENHANCEMENT APPROACH) AND ELABORATING THE ROLE OF THE APD.

THESE WORKS ARE THE BASIS FOR THE PRESENTATION AND CAN BE ACCESSED AND DOWNLOADED FROM THE ATLANTIC INSTITUTE OF CRIMINOLOGY WEBSITE OR BY CONTACTING THE PRESENTER AT clair@dal.ca

First Nations Police Officers Survey (with Chris Murphy). Ottawa: Solicitor General Canada, 1996.

Self-Administered First Nations' Policing: An Overview of Organizational and Managerial Issues. (With Chris Murphy) Ottawa: Aboriginal Policing Directorate, 2000.

Effectiveness and Sustainability In First Nations Policing, Ottawa: Aboriginal Policing Directorate, Solicitor General Canada, 2001.

Aboriginal Policing in Manitoba: A Report to the Aboriginal Justice Implementation Commission, Rick Linden, Donald Clairmont and Chris Murphy. Manitoba Inquiry, 2001.

First Nations' Self-Administered Policing: Laying the Groundwork for a Nation-Wide Case-Studies Approach. Ottawa: Aboriginal Policing Directorate Solicitor General, 2004.

For The Nonce: Policing Aboriginal Protests. (with Jim Potts) Ipperwash Inquiry, Ontario, 2006.

The Evolution of Aboriginal Policing in Canada, Ipperwash Inquiry, Ontario, 2006.

A Social Demographic Survey of Officers Policing in Aboriginal Communities.(with Richard Gill and David Redmond), Ottawa: Aboriginal Policing Directorate, 2008.