Book Reviews

The Concept of Truth. By Leslie Armour. Assen, the Netherlands: Van Gorcum and Comp. N. V., 1969. Cloth Hfl. 36.50.

Professor Armour's purpose is to examine in detail the three traditional types of theories of truth with a view to reconstructing, from what is worthy of retention in each, a new concept of truth. But this assumes that truth is a "separate problem", an assumption absent from much of contemporary philosophy. A. J. Ayer and D. W. Hamlyn, Armour holds, reduce the problem of truth to the epistemology of basis propositions. To fulfil his goal, the author must show that the problem of truth does permit other possible interpretations and that an adequate theory can be stated. Only if no other satisfactory view of truth can be formulated is one necessarily committed to declare that truth is "not a separate problem".

That truth is a separate topic from the terms of an empirical objectivity is well argued in this book to a point. It is not the author's case against the position of Ayre and Hamlyn, with all of which this reviewer agrees, but the proposed new concept of truth which undermines the challenge put to much of contemporary philosophical writing on the problem of truth. The search for a new theory of truth gains support, but not resolution, from the chapters which treat of the traditional accounts of truth. The analysis of the notion of correspondence, marred somewhat by excessive attention to elementary criticisms, centres on the inaccessibility of the empirical "world" to which propositions correspond. In the recognition of this point lies the main virtue of the coherence theorists. Yet coherence, with its stress on the logic of internal relations, omits the dynamic aspect of the cognitive act and, consequently, must also be found wanting. Pragmatism is credited with acknowledging the role of the observer in comprehension, but fails to provide any logical stability for the description of truth.

While the criticisms in each case are thorough and detailed they are not original, and for Professor Armour's purpose they need not be. They provide, by their received distillations, some of the main principles necessary for the required reconstruction of the concept of truth. Using Collingwood's contention that all cognition must be conceived as answers to questions, Professor Armour presents a concept of truth which integrates the logic of coherence and the dynamics of pragmatism. Questions set the presuppositions within which propositions can be termed "true" or "false".

Professor Armour's resolution of the question of the concept of truth is not unlike the coherence concept of truth of F. H. Bradley. Through his metaphysical distinction between what "exists" and what is "real", Bradley conceived truth within the limits of the presuppositions of existence, permitting thereby the integration of the logic of coherence, the dynamics of questioning and answering, and the resulting formulation of a "world" by which objectivity can be gained for propositions.

This comparison does not diminish, as such, Professor Armour's proposal. It does suggest, however, that his alternative is not beyond the domain of a metaphysically based coherence concept of truth where coherence is understood neither in terms of the extreme of a purely nominalistic logic, nor in the extreme of an ontology of the Absolute. Truth is a separate topic in the sense that it is not to be subordinated to the epistemology of basic propositions. But is it separable from metaphysics if it is to be adequately treated? That truth is inseparable from ontology is seen in the inadequacy of the author's rejoinder to the charge that his concept of truth, since the logic of truth operates within arbitrary limits set up by the asking of questions, results in an infinite regress. The reply holds only because the whole logic of Armour's concept of truth is based on the further presupposition that limits within which truth is determined are set functionally and not metaphysically. Yet questions *as presuppositions* are put, not from the conventions of experience, but from the accepted reality of experience. A logic of experience separated from a metaphysics of experience is an abstraction only and results in a "world" unlike that suggested by Armour in his proposed resolution and like, when tested thoroughly, the formal static "world" he asserts to be the main defect of coherence theories.

The new concept of truth is deficient because Armour commits himself in the first chapter of his book, for apparently valid reasons, to the position that truth is a "separate problem". It is a position, however, in which one cannot bring out the full complexity of the problem. Conversely, the deficiency of the proposed reconstruction renders the claim that truth is a "separate problem" without complete argumentation. And the problem returns to the interpretation of A. J. Ayre. A viable reconstruction is possible only in a metaphysical context. Thus truth is not an independent topic.

Yet this is a most clearly written and suggestive work, which should be examined by anyone for whom the traditional topic of truth has an appeal.

Mount Allison University R. A. STANWAY

Realism, Materialism, and the Mind: The Philosophy of Roy Wood Sellars. By Norman Paul Melchert. Edited by Marvin Farber. Springfield, Illinois: Charles C. Thomas [Toronto: Ryerson Press], 1968. Pp. xxii, 209. $10.50.

Roy Wood Sellars was a philosopher of considerable influence in North American thought in the forty-year period between 1910 and 1950. At a time when many members of the philosophic community were marching to the drums of logical positivism, linguistic analysis, or phenomenology, Sellars was constructing a metaphysical position. Professor Melchert's book is intended to be an exposition of that position — an exposition grounded in analysis of three issues in traditional philosophical theory: epistemology, ontology, and the mind-body problem.

Sellars was not completely consistent in the name he chose to describe his philosophy; but most of the time he termed it "naturalism". Very generally, naturalism is any doctrine which holds that the real entities of the world and, therefore the objects of knowledge, are things which occur naturally in the world. Thus, naturalism eliminates at once any possibility of holding supersensible things to be real or to be the objects of knowledge. More specifically, the form of this doctrine that Sellars and most "naturalists" adopt is the view that the real entities in the world are material things. For them, "only matter exists" (118).

Accordingly, only material things can be objects of knowledge, for surely knowledge is concerned with real — not unreal — things. The most immediate means that human beings have of gaining information about material things is, of course, through their sense impressions or perceptions. Hence perception, far from being the illusion that some philosophers influenced by Descartes have thought it to be, is a mode of knowledge. Information gained in perception does not exhaust knowledge, however, for perception is a low level of knowing which requires to be corrected or otherwise made precise by scientific methods. Sellars' is an empirical epistemology that recognizes different levels or layers of knowledge. But the factor common to all levels of knowledge — from the immediate deliverances of ordinary perception to the sophisticated rendering of scientific formulae — is the description of material entities.

So the theory of knowledge confirms that only matter is real. Yet a prime justification for this claim is the conviction that perception and corrections of perceptions yield knowledge of what is real. Melchert deals with the apparent circularity of the argument by suggesting that for Sellars neither the theory of knowledge nor the ontology assumes logical priority. There is no circularity but an attempt to frame both epistemological and ontological doctrines. The agreement and integration of these different aspects is a virtue of consistency, not the vice of *petitio principii.*

Obviously, holding the views he does requires Sellars to give a materialistic account of mind. In so doing, he eliminates the issue which has bedevilled philosophy for so long, the "body-mind problem". The problem disappears in naturalism, for only bodies are real; and minds, if they be recognized at all, must be understood as material in some sense. Sellars is very far indeed from eliminating the category of mind, and indeed undertakes to explain it as an "emergence" of matter. When organized as it is in the brain of living animals, matter produces effects which may be described as "consciousness" or intelligence.

Insofar as it indicates the correlation between various aspects of materialism, Melchert's book is useful. Other than this, however, the book has little strength. Because he follows Sellars so closely, Melchert is unable to gain the distance from his subject requisite to raising the problems the system surely entails. Discussion of these problems would certainly have been of greater service to Sellars than a necessarily brief summary of his doctrine.

The putative superiority of scientific modes of knowing to the deliverances of ordinary perception is one important issue which arises in Melchert's discussion of Sellars that remains altogether unexplored. Clearly every-day sense perceptions are at variance with experiences gained by using refined scientific instruments. Sellars argues that there is no difficulty involved in affirming both descriptions to be knowledge, but knowledge on two radically different levels. The crucial problem, however, is that knowledge on the scientific level is regarded as "higher" than sense perception and a correction of ordinary perceptions. Ordinarily, non-scientific knowledge, on the other hand, apparently can never correct scientific formulations.

It is not necessary to disavow this hierarchal structure of knowledge in order to appreciate that far more defence of it is necessary than Melchert provides. It is not, for instance, at all obvious why scientific formulations should occupy a higher level in the epistemological hierarchy than common-sense ones. The decision always to rank scientific judgments higher in the scale than ordinary perceptions is either arbitrary or else it is based upon some foundation. What this foundation is, Melchert gives not the slightest indication, and many of the defences which seem close at hand are themselves subject to serious question as to their adequacy.

A similar failure carefully to examine the foundations of Sellars' naturalism arises in connection with the interpretation of the key term, "matter". Melchert recognizes that there is great ambiguity in the philosophical use of the term, and reads Sellars as holding a rather formal definition. "Sellars might say, there is no uncertainty about the principal tenet of materialism . . . *that* about which the sciences attempt to give knowledge is the sum and substance of what *is*" (121). The difficulty that arises for Sellars is that science, and physics in particular, has increasingly abandoned the Newtonian notion of massive inpenetrable stuff in favour of dynamic concepts. Being is not then matter but activity.

Melchert attempts briefly to dismiss this problem by suggesting that simply because a theory adopts the claim that "matter and being are equivalent concepts" it "is not thereby committed to a particular theory of matter" (125). This may well be so. But what Melchert fails to understand is that if scientific theory is formulated in terms of energy, a philosophy which takes scientific doctrines as its content must also be phrased in these terms.

Sellars' thought, at least as Melchert describes it, most certainly is not framed in dynamic terms. Indeed if it were, a considerable difficulty would be created for the epistemology. No longer would it be possible to argue that scientific and common sense discuss essentially the same entities, but with different levels of accuracy. Quite the contrary would be true. The objects of sense perception which are perceived as occupying space, having mass and the like, are something vastly different from the objects of scientific inquiry which have been resolved into quanta of energy. There would thus be a sharp discontinuity between perception and scientific knowledge.

Apart from these defects, Melchert's book is marked by a dense style of exposition. The density is not relieved by the frequent references to material that has yet to be introduced in the discussion — there are at least twelve such references — or by the intrusion of several rather awkward colloquialisms.

Mount Allison University GORDON TREASH

The Dominican Republic: A Nation in Transition. By Howard J. Wiarda. New York: Praeger, 1969. Pp. 249. $7.00.

A forceful naval occupation of Santo Domingo by the United States in 1916, during President Woodrow Wilson's administration, lasted for eight years. During this time Rafael Trujillo joined the national constabulary that was being trained by the North American military forces. Trujillo rose rapidly in the ranks. In 1930 he seized power. He remained in power until his assassination in 1961.

Local and foreign business interests fell under his control, as well as the machinery of government, the management of the only political party, and even, on occasion, representatives of the Catholic Church. The political instability and unease that has marked Dominican affairs since 1961 can be said to have arisen out of the vacuum created by the exiling, persecutions, and extermination of political opponents during the thirty years of Trujillo's tyranny.

Professor Wiarda of the University of Massachusetts, who knows the country and its people well, places much emphasis in his book on recent events, although he does sketch in a summary of the country's historical past. Dr. Wiarda observes that meddling in politics by the Dominican military — there has also been meddling by political leaders in military cliques — has tended to postpone needed modernization and democratization of Dominican society and politics.

The gloom is pervasive, and not solely in the prospects for responsible government at the top. The Dominican peasantry is beset by a vicious circle of poverty, illiteracy, low wages, debt, disease, and lack of the job opportunities that could conceivably offer escape. The gap between the rich and the poor is widening. Government inefficiency and bitter partisanship add to Wiarda's and the reviewer's sorrow. And what of the future? This unhappy land faces an electoral campaign in which the leading candidate thus far was Vice-President under the former dictator.

University of Maryland WILLARD BARBER

ATLANTIC TRUST
COMPANY

C. B. HAVEY, MANAGING DIRECTOR

BARRINGTON AT GEORGE STREET, HALIFAX, N.S.
P. O. BOX 2224 TEL. 422-1701

LAWTON'S DRUG STORES

2151 Gottingen St.	429-5777
Bayers Road Shopping Centre	454-6409
Dartmouth Shopping Centre	466-2427
Lord Nelson Arcade	422-9686
Halifax Shopping Centre	454-8686
Scotia Square	429-5436

MOFFATT'S DRUG STORE LTD.

184 Portland Street Dartmouth, Nova Scotia

BALCOM-CHITTICK LIMITED

Pharmacists

Armdale Sheet Harbour
Halifax Kentville

DUFFUS, ROMANS, KUNDZINS AND ROUNSEFELL

ARCHITECTS AND ENGINEERS

1525 Birmingham St., Halifax, N. S. Telephone 429-6860

Maritime Dental Supply Co., Limited

*Service to the Dental Profession in
the Maritime Provinces.*

HALIFAX, N. S. and SAINT JOHN, N. B.

The Journals and Miscellaneous Notebooks of Ralph Waldo Emerson. Volume VII, 1838-1842. Edited by A. W. Plumstead and Harrison Hayford. Cambridge: Harvard University Press [Toronto: Saunders of Toronto], 1969. Pp. xxiii, 575. $16.50.

The seventh volume of the new edition of Emerson's *Journals* covers four of the most important and most productive years of Emerson's life. Marked by literary success, growing friendships, and personal unhappiness or bouts with the establishment, the journals of this period (beginning in June, 1838) trace the growth of Emerson's second book, the first series of *Essays*, and the mental wandering of his mind amidst the changing environment of mid-nineteenth century America. In this volume we see the first appearance of "The Sphinx", that appropriate symbol which Emerson so admired and which he often seemed identified with in the minds of his contemporaries. In July, 1838, Emerson made his celebrated visit to Harvard's Divinity School. In January, 1842, his first-born son died. It took the Divinity School longer to forgive Emerson than it took Emerson to forgive Death.

The journals for this period include much that was to become part of Emerson's well-known and important essays, "Self-Reliance", "The Over-Soul", and "Compensation". Many entries are concerned with his friendships and intellectual exchanges with Alcott, Margaret Fuller, Caroline Sturgis, W. E. Channing, Jones Very, and, of course, Thoreau, to whom he often refers as "my brave" or "my valiant Henry Thoreau". Emerson's intellectual debts to Carlyle, Coleridge, Goethe, and German literature in general is once more apparent. But the ways in which he makes what he learns from others into something uniquely his own is clearer at this stage in his life. These journals also demonstrate how fond he was of seventeenth-century prose and poetry, always rating writers of that century above those of his own time.

It is the journal for 1841 that records Emerson's well-known observation on the novels of the future. After preferring *Wilhelm Meister* to *Quentin Durward*, Emerson then writes "Yet a novel may teach me one thing as well as my choosings at the corner of the street which way to go, — whether to my errand or whether to the woods, — this, namely, that action inspires respect; action makes character, power, man, God. These novels will give way by & by to diaries or autobiographies; — captivating books if only a man knew how to choose among what he calls his experiences that which is really his experience, and how to record truth truly!" The art of fiction is of little interest to Emerson and what he has to say about novels shows the weakest side of his criticism; nevertheless, he knew rightly the direction in which fiction was to go in the years that were to come.

In general, this volume conforms to the same high standards of those that preceded it, but once again there are strange omissions in some of the notes. To cite only two examples: p. 69, note 195 makes no reference to "Nature"; p. 123,

Stewart, MacKeen & Covert

BARRISTERS AND SOLICITORS

500 BANK OF CANADA BUILDING, HALIFAX

P.O. BOX 997

Frank M. Covert, Q.C. Clyde W. Sperry, Q.C. J. William E. Mingo, Q.C.
Henry B. Rhude, Q.C. Donald A. Kerr, Q.C. David R. Chipman, Q.C.
John D. Moore Ronald N. Pugsley A. L. MacDonald, Q.C.
J. Thomas MacQuarrie David A. Stewart George A. Caines
Arthur G. H. Fordham Donald J. Morrison Brian Flemming
Donald H. Oliver G. David N. Covert M. David Leonard
James S. Cowan D. H. McDougall J. Gerald Godsoe Jr.
Hugh K. Smith Joel E. Pink

a modern company
over 121 years young

That's what those who know us well say about us. While we keep abreast of today's new ideas and fields of endeavour, we have been privileged to build upon a firm foundation of more than one hundred and twenty-one years of experience in the various fields of life insurance. What's more, we care about our clientele.

The CANADA LIFE
Assurance Company

note 358 ignores the obvious essay in question, "The Over-Soul". In a very important and well edited volume, these are of course only minor points. Volume seven is continually fascinating because it contains so many of the journal entries that were quickly to appear in the essays. It also includes, however, some gems that were never used. This reviewer's special favourite, "They call it Christianity, I call it Consciousness", is Emersonian to the core.

University of Alberta E. J. ROSE

The Correspondence of Walt Whitman. Vol. IV, 1886-1889. Vol V, 1890-1892. Edited by Edwin Haviland Miller. New York University Press [Toronto: Copp Clark], 1969. Pp. vii, 458, ix, 365. $12.50 each.

Seventy per cent of the approximately 1400 letters contained in these two volumes of Walt Whitman's correspondence are published here for the first time. In addition to the letters written during the last seven years of the poet's life, an addendum includes an additional sixty letters, written in earlier times, which have come to light since the publication of the first three volumes of the series.

In his introduction, Professor Miller notes that for Whitman "a letter was a personal document: it was not autobiography, it was not an excuse to state esthetic theories, and it was not written for posterity" (IV, p. 2). Whitman's letters generally live up to this dictum. The critic, looking for explication of Whitman's canon, will find little here that is revealing. On the other hand, the reader who is interested in an almost daily chronicle of a great poet's declining years will find in these letters insight into the courage and spirit of a man confronted with continual pain and gradual paralysis.

As his health declined, Whitman's diffuse correspondence became his principal contact with the outside world. For the most part, the letters are weighted with domestic trivia; we learn what he ate for lunch, the state of the weather, about his own and his friends' health, or of the coming and going of his frequent visitors. A smaller group of letters are business notes concerned with the mechanics of editing and publishing his later works. During these years he released two complete editions of *Leaves of Grass*, *November Boughs*, and *Good-By My Fancy*, along with other things which, in his own words, were often "nothing but 'pot boilers'" (letter 1443). His letters to Tennyson, Edward Carpenter, W. M. Rossetti, Samuel Clemens, Hamlin Garland, John Burroughs, and John Addington Symonds will doubtless be of interest to some readers, although they seldom deal with literary matters. Probably the most famous of the lot is the letter to Symonds in which Whitman claimed to have sired six children. Whitman also wrote long and often interesting letters to the Australian poet, Bernard O'Dowd, in which he requested information about Australian idiosyncrasies.

COMPLIMENTS OF

STANDARD CONSTRUCTION

COMPANY LIMITED

GENERAL CONTRACTORS

2021 Upper Water Street, Halifax, N. S.

ThompsonAdams
&
COMPANY LIMITED

INSURANCE AGENTS

Founded 1899 — Ph. 423-1288

1668 HOLLIS ST., P.O. BOX 1134 HALIFAX, N.S

THE MARITIME LIFE ASSURANCE COMPANY

CAREER
OPPORTUNITIES

Head Office
5435 Spring Garden Road
Halifax

Of interest to Canadian readers is the strong affection which Whitman held for Dr. Richard Maurice Bucke who was in charge of the Insane Asylum at London, Ontario. Bucke had gone to Camden to meet Whitman after undergoing a mystical experience as a result of reading *Leaves of Grass*. Their strong friendship developed during the last years of Whitman's life, and Bucke was the recipient of more letters during this period than was any other single correspondent. Canadians have paid little attention to Bucke, yet his association with Whitman was just one aspect of a fascinating career which saw him in the roles of traveller, doctor, writer, inventor, and public lecturer. These two volumes of Whitman correspondence will provide useful leads for the enterprising biographer who finally arrives to chronicle Bucke's life.

Above all, it is the attitude revealed in the letters that makes them remarkable. In spite of his declining health and gradual isolation from the world, Whitman always radiated a sense of optimism about life. He frankly acknowledged his coming death and accepted it with stoic resolution, spending his last days preparing his burial vault in Camden. The letters reveal a man who thrived on adulation, and in Bucke, Traubel, O'Dowd, William Sloane Kennedy, and Dr. John Johnston, he found adoring disciples. These men created a cult around Whitman which has tended to obscure the man himself. These letters, while showing that Whitman enjoyed public esteem, also reveal a man who often saw through the elegiac pronouncements of his friends. His comments on reviews and reviewers reveal a critical self-awareness which has not often been attributed to Whitman.

Each volume contains a useful introduction. Professor Miller has done a fine job of editing the letters, and his footnotes provide a continual source of information which is, at times, more fascinating than the letters themselves. Included in the volumes is a check list of Whitman's "lost" letters as well as a useful list of manuscript sources. All in all, these volumes are superbly set out as useful tools for the Whitman scholar.

Dalhousie University STANLEY E. MCMULLIN

Canadian Books

Partners in Development: Report of the Commission on International Development, Lester B. Pearson, Chairman. New York: Praeger Publishers, 1969. Pp. 399. $2.50.

Foreign aid programs seem to have reached a point of crisis. In both the donor and the recipient countries, a cloud of scepticism and disillusionment hangs over the feasibility as well as the purpose of international economic assistance. In the

Compliments of

Gulf

GULF OIL CANADA LIMITED

6009 QUINPOOL RD. HALIFAX, N. S.

PHONE 422-1741

The Canadian member of the World-Wide Gulf Oil Family

Are Salesmen People?

Not necessarily. Well-designed and carefully printed reports and business stationery can also "sell" the character of your firm.

We offer a complete and thoughtful printing service, capable of producing effective "salesmen" for you.

KENTVILLE PUBLISHING COMPANY LIMITED

390 MAIN STREET, KENTVILLE, NOVA SCOTIA, TELEPHONE 678-2121

donor countries, recent years have witnessed increasing criticism of wasteful use of aid funds in recipient countries, together with charges that aid programs lead eventually to political or military entanglements. Moreover, at a time of widespread concern about poverty and deprivation, and about problems of pollution and environment, funds diverted to aid programs are increasingly re-appraised within a framework of competing priorities. In the developing countries, too, there are signs of frustration about the nature of the aid relationship and of growing impatience about the fruits of foreign economic assistance.

Deterioration in the climate surrounding foreign aid is reflected in the flow of economic assistance from the industrialized countries to the developing nations. During the 1950s there was an impressive increase in the volume of official development aid. On the other hand, the aid level remained approximately stationary during 1961-1967 and actually declined in 1968 despite the fact that industrialized countries experienced rapid increases in their GNP in this period. Ironically enough, this means that the last decade, officially labelled by the United Nations as the Development Decade, witnessed a declining flow of aid funds to developing countries expressed as a percentage of the GNP of the developed countries.

The Pearson Report, significantly entitled *Partners in Development,* is a spirited effort to restate the case for foreign aid in the current atmosphere of doubt and apathy. The Report consists of eleven chapters (and a lengthy appendix) which may be broadly divided into three parts. In the first part (chapter I), the Commissioners present a brief discussion of the rationale for foreign aid and a summary of their principal recommendations. The second part of the Report (chapters 2 and 3) is a general review of the post-war economic development in less-developed countries. After the standard warning that the latter represent a world of diversity in their economic and social framework, level of development, and potential for further growth, the Commissioners proceed to an historical comparison of growth rates (based on the average annual rate of growth of the Gross Domestic Product) between the industrialized countries on the one hand and the developing ones on the other. Interestingly enough, this comparison turns out in favour of the developing countries and the Commissioners find comfort in the knowledge that the rate of income growth in the developing countries has been in line with the 5% annual target established under the UN Development Decade and that if this rate is maintained "it will quadruple income per person in sixty to seventy years" (p. 28), enabling several of the developing countries to reach levels of income currently enjoyed in Western Europe.

The third part of the Report, containing the Commissioners' recommendations for action, is the longest and consists of eight chapters covering 150 pages. The core of the Report is chapter 7 dealing with the question of how much aid should be transferred from developed to developing countries. As aid is but one type of resource transfer, the Commissioners examine this question within the context of

best
tea
you
ever
tasted...

Selected
Orange Pekoe
MORSE'S
GAUZE BAGS
TEA BAGS
2 CUP SIZE
Orange Pekoe
MORSE'S
MORSE'S

MORSE'S

of course is....

Compliments of

National Sea Products Limited

HALIFAX, NOVA SCOTIA

Producers of Following Seafoods....

SEA BRAND

High Liner

40 FATHOMS

"total net flow of resources", which cover (1) official development assistance, or "aid" proper; (2) other official flows comprising official export credits, purchases by governments of bonds, loans, and participations of multilateral agencies; and (3) private flows, including direct investment, portfolio investments and private export credits. Net transfer of resources of all types from non-communist developed countries to developing countries in 1968 amounted to $12.8 billion. This figure represents an actual decline in the volume of official development assistance over 1967, but a significant increase in private flows. A country-by-country analysis shows that the volume of U.S.A. aid, which increased substantially during 1950-63, has been declining since. France and Britain became major aid-givers in the 1950s. French aid has been declining since 1962; British official assistance reached $500 million annually in the 1964-67 period but declined to $430 million in 1968. West Germany and Japan, both starting late, have become major aid-givers. Canada is becoming a large aid-giver.

The vital question facing the Commissioners was to estimate the need among developing countries for external resources to promote development. This question is, no doubt, partly dependent on the donor countries' ability to provide aid. The conclusion reached by the Commissioners is that "the flow of resources to developing countries should be at least 1 percent of the gross national product of the rich countries (pp. 143-4). This target, by no means original, has the great merit of simplicity. However, only a few of the aid-giving countries met this condition in 1968 (France, Netherlands, Germany, Belgium, and Japan); Canada's performance was 0.49, that of the U.S.A. 0.65. Accordingly, the Commissioners recommend that industrialized countries increase their resource transfers to low-income countries to meet this target as quickly as possible but in no case later than 1975. The implementation of this target would almost double the total flow of resources from developed to developing countries by 1975 and is certain to add considerable financial burden on some of the donor countries.

In addition to the 1% total resource transfer target, the Commissioners recommend that "official development assistance" from each aid-giver increase up to 0.70 percent of its GNP by 1975 or shortly thereafter but in no case later than 1980. This target, however, would require a very substantial increase in aid disbursements; from $6.4 billion in 1968 to $16.2 billion in 1975 for all of the non-communist donor countries. The Commissioners attach great importance to this target as it is basic to their recommendation of 6% annual growth rate for the developing countries in the 1970s (p. 124).

In chapter 11 there is an interesting discussion of the relative merits of bilateral and multilateral aid. It is noted that bilateral flows still account for a very substantial percentage of total resource transfers to developing countries, despite the growth of multilateral development agencies. The Commssioners recognize that there are several reasons which make bilateral arrangements more attractive

Succession Duties Threaten Even a Small Estate...

Money for succession duties will have to be raised promptly when you die and may mean that your wife will have to sacrifice part of the estate you want her to have. The proper Sun Life policy will help meet these payments and other taxes and last expenses, so that your estate can be preserved for your family. For full particulars, mail the coupon below.

SUN LIFE ASSURANCE COMPANY OF CANADA

F. R. C. MacDonald
Senior Representative

Please send information on life insurance and succession duties.

Name ____________________

Address ____________________

____

Date of birth ____________________

YOU'LL ENJOY SHOPPING AT

Simpson's

If unable to shop in person TELEPHONE 455-4111 or write Personal Shopping Service.

THE ROBERT SIMPSON EASTERN LIMITED ● HALIFAX

Cornell, Macgillivray Limited

Halifax, Nova Scotia
Bank of Nova Scotia Bldg.
Tel. 423-1253

St. John's, Nfld.
Board of Trade Bldg.
Tel. 722-1462

Member of the Montreal Stock Exchange

Member of The Investment Dealers' Association of Canada

to aid-givers, ranging from historic ties with the recipient country to motives of greater say in the allocation and use of aid funds. They believe, however, that multilateral aid should be strengthened because multilateral agencies can play "a leading role as intermediaries . . . between suppliers and users of aid . . . with the character of a truly international effort, reducing any overtones of charity or interventionism which at times embittered the aid process in the past" (p. 213-4). For this and other reasons, the Commissioners recommend that aid-providers increase grants and capital subscriptions for multilateral development aid programs to a minimum of 20 percent of their total official development assistance flows by 1975. This recommendation, however, is supplemented with another designed to improve the machinery and workings of multilateral agencies "to provide more leadership and direction and to make development assistance . . . a genuinely international effort" (p. 21). As anyone with some experience in the aid process may testify, there is considerable room for improvement in this direction, particularly in the degree of co-ordination not only between bilateral and multilateral programs but within the various multilateral agencies themselves.

Such, then, is the Pearson Report — on the whole a sound and competent work. It would be easy to criticize the targets set for future aid flows into the developing countries as being too modest or inadequate. Certainly, the task of development in the low-income countries is so vast that practically any amount of aid can be regarded as insufficient. For the same reason, it would be equally easy to feel despondent about the contribution of aid to development. In the final analysis, it would be extremely hard to quarrel with the judgement of the Commissioners: "Even in the best of conditions, development will be untidy, uneven, and even ridden with turmoil. Great forward movements in history usually are. The thing to remember is that the process, global in scope, and international in nature, must succeed if there is finally to be peace, security, and stability in the world" (p. 11).

University of Windsor — OZAY MEHMET

Three Tests for Democracy. By David Braybrooke. New York: Random House [Toronto: Random House of Canada], 1969. Pp. viii, 240. Paper, $2.25.

The last two decades have seen a flood of books on the topic of democracy. Scholars, journalists, and concerned citizens have re-examined democracy from almost every conceivable angle. To this literature must now be added *Three Tests for Democracy*, in which David Braybrooke attempts to treat the subject from the that the author should think that the term "democracy" is easily understood, indeed almost univocal, precisely at the time when disagreement about democracy is greater than it has been since the Depression. It is patent that when the author refers to

COMPLIMENTS

of

KENNEY CONSTRUCTION COMPANY

LIMITED

HALIFAX
NOVA SCOTIA

YARMOUTH
NOVA SCOTIA

McInnes, Cooper & Robertson

BARRISTERS, SOLICITORS, &c.

1673 BEDFORD ROW, HALIFAX, N. S.

Donald McInnes, Q.C.
J. H. Dickey, Q.C.
L. A. Bell, Q.C.
R. A. Cluney
H. E. Wrathall
Stewart McInnes
J. A. F. Macdonald
John Cooper

G. B. Robertson, Q.C.
Harold F. Jackson, Q.C.
Hector McInnes
J. M. Davison
L. J. Hayes
George Cooper
David Ritcey
Peter McDonough

viewpoint of British-style analytical philosophy. His book, however, is not really about the politics of democracy; for that would go beyond the province of analytical philosophy, which confines itself to the clarification of words. Thus, according to the author, he is not trying to say what democracy is but rather to explain precisely what advocates of democracy *say* about it. Unfortunately it is impossible to tell precisely which advocates of democracy Professor Braybrooke has in mind, for nowhere does he identify them. His references to "Western" or "English-Speaking" or "liberal" democrats do not help a great deal, for there is hardly universal consensus on the subject, even within one nation such as Canada. It is peculiar the opinions of "advocates of democracy", he is in fact giving us his own views, which may be more or less widely shared. On this basis, then, he proceeds to construct three tests by which one who shares the same assumptions can decide whether he lives in a democracy or whether one government is more democratic than another.

The first test concerns the notion of rights. Professor Braybrooke argues quite convincingly that property rights have historically been the core of the liberal defence of democracy. But since, as is well known, property relationships have changed in this century from individual ownership towards collective or corporate possession, a new notion of property rights is also needed. Braybrooke finds this in the concept of livelihood; to have this is the precondition for exercising other rights today, just as the ownership of property used to be essential. The "test" then simply consists in investigating whether a government indeed guarantees the livelihood of all its citizens. The ramifications of this for economic policy Braybrooke leaves undiscussed; most of this section of the book is concerned with determining what a right is, rather than elaborating an operational test.

The same is true of the second section, where the author discusses welfare. Most of his treatment is devoted to distinguishing the concept of welfare from that of "preference". He finally concludes that the two are not identical, for there are some things so fundamental that they are clearly a part of welfare, even if an occasional person were so misguided that he could not see so. After a detour into the problems of utility and welfare in formal economic theory, the author finally arrives at the common-sense position that welfare includes "food, safety, clothing, shelter, medical care, education, congenial employment, [and] companionship". The "test" for welfare thus amounts to taking a census of the items of food, etc., available to citizens. The government which succeeds in providing best for its citizens in relation to available wealth is therefore the most democratic. Unfortunately the author is silent on the ticklish question of how one might measure companionship or congeniality of employment.

The third section of the book, devoted to collective preference, differs from the other two. Here Braybrooke spends much less time in definitions and much more time in elaborating the test. Although the details cannot be recounted here, the idea (given to the author by Ithiel da Sola Pool of M.I.T.) is ingenious. It

EATON'S

Canada's

Largest Retail Organization

CUNARD'S FUEL
answers the burning question

S. CUNARD & COMPANY
LIMITED

Heat Merchants Since 1827

amounts to designing a computer simulation program for the electoral geography of a nation, using standard demographic variables to remove the distortion which electoral districting inevitably imposes. The program could simulate mock elections, in which candidates firmly pledged to specific policies would run. The nation's government would be considered democratic on this test if over a period of time it produced the same policy results as the simulation in a stipulated proportion of cases (arbitrarily set by the author at 2/3). Although such a project would be difficult, it is probably feasible even with today's state of knowledge in political science (*cf.* Pool's simulation of the 1960 election in the U.S.A.; the non-technical reader may consult Eugene Burdick's novel *The 480*).

It is only semi-facetiously, however, that it may be asked: why not let the real policy decisions of government be decided by simulation, since it is a superior way of discovering the popular will? The question, and the answer to it, illustrate a weakness in Braybrooke's approach. At least by the greatest advocates of democracy, such as J. S. Mill, collective preference has never been advanced singly as a goal, but always in combination with the need for making the wise and right decision; thus democracy may need mechanisms for restraining collective preference. Although Braybrooke has not introduced this consideration into his analysis, he is clearly aware of it. Thus the note of pathos on which the book ends: "Let us be very clear also that a government may do very well . . . on all three tests formulated in this book; and yet pursue wicked policies. . . . It may pursue belligerent policies, callously devastating other countries, and cruelly subordinating the interests of their peoples to the supposed interests of its own."

University of Calgary T. E. FLANAGAN

Andrew Graham's Observations on Hudson's Bay, 1767-1791. Edited by Glyndwr Williams. London: The Hudson's Bay Record Society, Vol. XXVII, 1969. Pp. lxxii, 423, 2 maps. Available through subscription to the Hudson's Bay Record Society, Beaver House, Great Trinity Lane, London, E.C.4. (Annual subscription $5.00; one volume published every two years.)

Andrew Graham, a Scot still in his teens, came to Churchill on Hudson's Bay in 1749 as servant to the sloopmaster, and climbed with fair rapidity to become the most important factor of his time. Nothing is known about his education. The editor has modernized his spelling but has left intact his peculiar grammar, and the text shows that Graham had the Scottish tendency never to use a short word if a long one would do. That he was practical and shrewd, with a keen eye for profit both for the company and for himself is expectable enough, but his keen interest in birds, fish, plants, and Indians was unique in his day and area. Unfortunately, little of his writing — done to pass the long winters — reached publica-

BURCHELL, SMITH, JOST, BURCHELL & CHISHOLM

Barristers, Solicitors, Etc.

Canada Permanent Building — *HALIFAX, N.S.*
P.O. Box 36

Hon. C. J. Burchell, Q.C. (1967)
F. D. Smith, Q.C. (1967)
W. H. Jost, Q.C.
C. W. Burchell, Q.C.

S. P. Chisholm, Q.C.
Aaron Zive
A. David MacAdam
Alan G. Hayman

PARIS AMERICAN ACADEMY

SUMMER IN FRANCE

July 1 — August 12, 1970

Course of study..Paris
Music/Arts Festival.......................French Riviera

SIX MAJOR DEPARTMENTS

french — music — art history — dance — theater — painting

NO AGE LIMIT

for app. (air mail)
PARIS AMERICAN ACADEMY
269 Rue Saint Jacques — Paris Q5, France

CANADA PERMANENT TRUST COMPANY

- Complete Trust Services
- Savings
- Mortgages

1646 Barrington St. — 5160 Prince St.

HALIFAX, N. S.

Branches in All Atlantic Provinces

tion except when Hutchins, his surgeon and successor, sent his own and Graham's notes on birds to Pennant for his *Arctic Zoology* without crediting Graham with any of the observations. The present volume now gives Graham's original writings, where not duplicated, as well as Hutchins' minor contributions, and redresses the piracy. This is important, since Graham's interests were far wider than those of Hutchins and Pennant.

Graham seems never to have travelled far from the shores of Hudson's Bay, except for his few marine adventures in attempting to win the Eskimo into the Company's orbit. In this he was successful and, in the editor's well-justified opinion, became the creator of the "Caribou Eskimos". He found the Eskimo in a desperate state. In the bow-and-arrow days of a century before, they could hold their own against the Indians and reinforce their sea-culture with caribou hunts on the mainland; but guns had reached the Indians first, and the Eskimo had been driven to the offshore islands where they frequently starved. Graham found the Eskimo dangerous, treacherous, and cannibalistic. By means of minor gifts and trade he managed to win a wary friendship with the Eskimo. He was at last allowed to borrow two boys to spend a winter at the fort, and in the spring he returned them intact. The next step was to train Eskimo to use guns and, once this was mastered, they understood the necessity of trade with the Company. The guns redressed the balance of power: the Eskimo were again able to hunt caribou in safety and trade with the forts, and even to oust the Crees from some of their territory. Once they found themselves established in good caribou country, they abandoned the more difficult life of the sea.

Because of the limitations of his travels, Graham's observations are cumulative and reinforced by a great deal of hearsay learned from the Indians. The editor recognizes this and attributes the dubious information to the politeness of the Indians, who told what they thought would please. It may be attributed rather to the Indian's fear of losing face if he admitted to not knowing anything. Cumulative experience does not make for enthralling reading, and this volume is far less vivid than Hearne's *Voyage*, but it is infinitely richer in detailed information. Here is the first attempt to produce a list of mammals, birds, reptiles, fish, insects, and plants of an area of Canada, and this only a few years after the appearance of the *Systema Naturae* of Linnaeus.

The descriptions of the mammals are very good when first-hand, but the rare or more distant animals are often confused. They have Indian names which are sometimes helpful, and specialists have provided the current names or have made guesses at the dubious descriptions. The birds are described in Linnaean fashion, feather by feather, with detail that is meaningful only if one has in hand a dead bird of the same species, sex, age, and season. Fortunately, Graham added descriptions of the behaviour of those birds familiar to him. Even so, some are passed over without identification by the specialists. On p. 101, a reference to "a much larger species of woodpecker with a blooming crimson crown" has no comment from the experts, though it is obviously the Pileated Woodpecker found later in Hutchins' list. On p. 107, a "Tawny Owl" is rejected as "a European bird not found in North America", but one needs to have the bird in one's hand to distinguish the European Tawny Owl from the common American Barred Owl.

The plants are more tantalizing. Many of the trees and shrubs are identifiable, but the herbs often have the names of familiar European flowers and weeds which are classified as "adventive" in this continent. There are too many species of plants to make it possible to accept these names as meaningful.

Graham had great knowledge of both the language and customs of the Crees. He gave them due credit for their hardiness and skill, for their intense love for their children, and for the conjugal affection which he noticed more often than did other observers. He insisted that the good relationships of the Company's agents with the Indians had been due to honest dealing, and that the success of the fur-trade was proportionate to a friendly attitude to the Indians. On the other hand, he was well aware that the Indian's sympathy was usually limited to his own band and that one could not expect honesty to be rewarded with honesty. His description of Cree life and equipment is detailed; that of the Eskimo is limited to their summer activities. His plan of the areas occupied by the other tribes with whom he had contact is as exact as was possible in that shifting period when European guns and Spanish horses were upsetting a pattern already confused by the spread of Indian agriculture, but his knowledge of their habits and quality diminished with their distance. He appended short vocabularies of a number of Indian languages.

Much of the last part of the book concerns the Company factories and the life of the servants, with a wealth of detail invaluable to reconstructors of the period. The price of the various furs from the noble beaver to the paltry mink is catalogued, and the payment in quantity and in kind is listed, with details of which were valid tender for guns and brandy, which only for food and baubles. Graham recognized the evil effects of brandy upon the Indians, but he does not seem to have questioned the morality of selling it, although each servant of the Company was limited to six gallons of brandy a year. Theirs was a hard and dangerous life in temperatures from 65° below zero in winter to 80° above in summer, paid for by the princely wage of twelve to twenty pounds a year.

The editor has gone to immense pains in comparing publications and handwritings in reaching his conclusions, and the assembling of overlapping writings of different periods has made of them an excellent whole, a trustworthy matter-of-fact picture of an important facet of Canadian history, too often ignored or misunderstood.

Wolfville, Nova Scotia J. S. Erskine