



## BOARD OF GOVERNORS

**APPROVED Minutes of the Meeting (Open Session)  
Held on Tuesday, April 15, 2014 at 3:00 p.m.  
University Hall, Macdonald Building**

**MEMBERS PRESENT:** Jim Spatz (Chair), Jay Abbass, Michelle Awad, Ramz Aziz, John Baxter, Barrie Black, Bill Black, Joyce Carter, Wadih Fares, Richard Florizone, Fred Fountain, Lloyd Fraser, John Hutton, Courtney Larkin, Lori MacLean, George McLellan, Ibrahim Merdan, Aubrey Palmeter, Sherry Porter, Chris Smith, Candace Thomas, Gail Tomblin Murphy

**NON-MEMBERS PRESENT:** Susan Brousseau (University Secretary), Ian Nason (Acting VP Finance & Administration), Bonnie Neuman (VP Student Services), Carolyn Watters (VP Academic & Provost), Grace Chang (Minute Taker)

**REGRETS:** Bob Hanf, Laurie Jennings, Paula Simon, Rob Sobey, Lawrence Stordy, Martha Crago (VP Research), Floyd Dykeman (VP External)

### 1. Approval of Agenda

Moved by B. Black, seconded by S. Porter:

**THAT the agenda for April 15, 2014 be approved as presented.**

**The motion CARRIED.**

### 2. Consent Agenda

Item 2.4 was removed from the Consent Agenda at the request of W. Fares in order to address one question.

#### 2.1 Approval of Minutes of the Meeting of February 11, 2014

**THAT the minutes of the meeting of February 11, 2014 be approved as presented.**

**Approved by CONSENT.**

#### 2.2 Appointment of Student Board Members

**THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Governance and Nominating Committee, approve the appointment of Ramz Aziz as a Student Board member from May 1, 2014 to April 30, 2015, and the appointment of Rebecca Haworth as a Student Board member from May 1, 2014 to April 30, 2016.**

**Approved by CONSENT.**

### **2.3 Eligibility Criteria for Student Board Members**

**THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Governance and Nominating Committee, approve the Eligibility Criteria for Student Board Members, as presented.**

**Approved by CONSENT.**

### **2.5 Student Experience Committee – Revised Terms of Reference**

**THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Governance and Nominating Committee, recommend to the Board of Governors the revised Terms of Reference for the Student Experience Committee as presented.**

**Approved by CONSENT.**

### **2.4 Interim Spending Authority**

Members then dealt with Item 2.4 which had been removed from the Consent Agenda. W. Fares queried why the University's budget cycle is such that the annual operating budget is presented at the June meeting rather than in April. I. Nason responded that the University has an extensive budget process that includes consultations with students on proposed tuition and other fees in February and March and these are significant elements of the budget. It was also noted that the provincial government notification on the operating grant for the next year is not received until December or sometimes January of the preceding fiscal year. It would be difficult, in this cycle of government notice and consultations on these two significant elements, to bring forward a budget in time for the April meeting.

Moved by M. Awad, seconded by Bill Black:

**THAT in order to allow the continued operation of the University until such time as the 2014-2015 operating budget is given final approval, the Board of Governors authorizes expenditures of up to 25% of the 2013-14 approved operating budget amounts. The President or his designate, in consultation with the Executive Committee of the Board, is authorized to approve expenditures in excess of 25% in special cases to permit the orderly management of the University.**

**The motion CARRIED.**

### **3. Business Arising from the Minutes**

There was no business arising from the minutes.

### **4. Chair's Report**

J. Spatz reported on the recent presentation of the 2014 Governors Awards to students Ding Fan, Taylor Thompson, Kit Moran, George Woodhouse, Caitlin Urquhart and Ishika Sharma, in recognition of their exceptional leadership and community service. Dr. Spatz welcomed new student Board member, Ramz Aziz, to his first meeting and also recognized Rebecca Haworth who will join the Board as a student member on May 1st. He thanked outgoing student Board member, Ibrahim Merdan, for his service on the Board over the past two years.

Dr. Spatz also offered congratulations to Joyce Carter on her new role as President and CEO of the Halifax International Airport Authority, and to Fred Fountain on the announcement that he is to receive an honorary degree from Acadia University during its spring convocation ceremonies.

Dr. Spatz reported on the two motions approved by the Board Executive Committee in the interval since the last Board meeting. The motions are as follows:

1. ATTSVE Project in Ethiopia – Contribution Agreement (Approved March 6, 2014)

**BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Executive Committee, on behalf of the Board of Governors, and on the recommendation of the Operations Committee, approve a six year contribution agreement with the federal Department of Foreign Affairs, Trade and Development to administer and participate in a research and development project entitled “Agricultural Transformation through Stronger Vocational Education (ATTSVE) Project” in Ethiopia commencing late March, 2014.**

2. Appointment of Student Board Member (Approved March 27, 2014)

**BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Executive Committee, on behalf of the Board of Governors, and on the recommendation of the Governance and Nominating Committee, approve the appointment of Ramz Aziz as a Student Board member to fill the position vacated by Sagar Jha, for a term to run until April 30, 2014.**

## 5. President's Report

R. Florizone highlighted several items in his report, including progress on the drafting of a *Strategic Directions* document based on the *100 Days of Listening* report and the feedback received. It is anticipated that this strategic directions document will be presented for Senate and Board approval later this spring. Dr. Florizone reported briefly on the release of the final Budget Advisory Report LI and the plan to bring forward a balanced budget for approval in June. He also noted some of the highlights from the recent federal and provincial budgets that are likely to have positive impacts for universities, including (on the federal side), increased funding for research and infrastructure, and (under the provincial budget), a 1% increase in the government grant to universities and greater funding for graduate students. Dr. Florizone also noted an upcoming trip to the University of Waterloo which will provide an opportunity for university and government representatives from Nova Scotia to explore a system in place at another U15 institution and to examine what Dalhousie and others might learn from it. Lastly, Dr. Florizone reminded members that convocation ceremonies will celebrate the accomplishments of graduates in May and invited Board members to participate in the events.

At the end of his report, Dr. Florizone spoke briefly to the University's continuing consideration of the fossil fuel divestment issue and acknowledged the students who had turned out to demonstrate their support for this issue. He noted that this is a complex issue that requires a balancing of interests and that it is important that the University take appropriate time to consider all of the implications. He noted that the Board had referred this issue to the Board Investment Committee at an earlier meeting.

Following his report, Dr. Florizone responded to questions from members on the University library and where it fits within the *100 Days* report, and on graduate student funding.

## 6. Dalhousie Student Union President's Report

R. Aziz, incoming DSU President, highlighted several priorities noted in his written report, including a review of the DSU Equity and Accessibility Office pilot project and the continuing work on a proposed renovation and/or expansion of the Student Union Building. He also noted three items brought to his attention by other students that he wished to highlight for the Board: 1) concerns over tuition fee increases, especially for international students and students in medicine and dentistry; 2) concerns

among international students regarding the need for early awareness of future fee increases over the course of their programs and the need for improved services and supports for international students; and 3) the issue of fossil fuel divestment and the desire of Divest Dal students to see the establishment of a task force to work with administration on this issue. With respect to this last issue, he noted that students would like to see a discussion of the issue at the June meeting (out of the work of this working group or task force), with the goal of a decision by the October 2014 Board meeting.

R. Florizone responded that he expects that there could be a report at the June meeting of the work to date and where the Investment Committee is in its consideration of the issues. At the same time, it is not clear that the Board would get to a decision by October and he would not want to create that expectation. G. McLellan, Chair of the Investment Committee, added that there was a very good meeting with Divest Dal representatives in February; the students attending made an excellent presentation and provided additional information subsequent to the meeting. He noted that there are some positives to what has been put in front of the Committee and also a good understanding and recognition by the Divest Dal representatives of the complexities of the issue and the fact that Committee members must sift through these carefully. He noted that it is important that students understand that the Board takes this issue very seriously and that there is recognition that climate change is an important issue, but that there are other issues that figure into the consideration of divestment as well. He noted that Dalhousie has been working with its Investment Fund managers to implement and further develop the Environment, Social and Governance (ESG) principles that have been incorporated in the University's Statement of Investment Policies and Guidelines. He concluded by saying that the Committee has the information provided by Divest Dal, that it will consider this and will respond to the individuals who met with the Committee. He also noted that the Divest Dal group recognizes that the discussions underway involve the endowment funds, not the pension funds, but having said that, the Committee still must consider various issues so as not to prejudice investment outcomes that mitigate against tuition increases, funds for books, scholarships and other important programs.

R. Florizone asked for the patience of students and understanding that important decisions require time and careful consideration. He committed to having a report at the June meeting as to where the University is in its consideration of the issue. J. Spatz noted that it is important that students understand how the Board works and that this is largely through its committees. This issue has been referred to the Investment Committee and the Board will wait to receive a report from the Committee.

## **7. Items for Discussion**

### **7.1 Budget Advisory Committee Final Report LI (including Report on Student Fee Consultations)**

C. Watters spoke to the final report of the Budget Advisory Committee (BAC), which presents the Operating Budget Plan for 2014-15. Dr. Watters also reported on the recent student consultation sessions carried out under the Board-approved Tuition and Fee Consultation Procedures and reviewed the recommendations on tuition and fee changes for 2014-15. She also highlighted the recommendations and strategies for closing the projected net budget shortfall of \$10.1 million. The final budget recommendation will come to the Board for approval at the June meeting.

Following her report, Dr. Watters addressed several questions focused on the notice students receive around likely tuition fee increases over the course of their programs, and the use of reserve funds to close the budget shortfall. Members also queried what the Board and Administration will need to do to address budget issues in the longer term. R. Florizone responded that these are issues that are being experienced across the country and beyond. He noted that part of the conundrum is that labour costs account for at least 70% of costs and that there is not really one "silver bullet" to solve these issues. He offered that the University needs to work on all three levers – revenues, costs and productivity – on a multi-year basis.

## 8. Items for Decision

### Operations

#### 8.1 2014-2015 Student Fee Proposals

##### 8.1.1 Tuition and Facilities Renewal Fees

Following presentation of the motion, I. Merdan spoke to the concerns of international students that there has not been a perceived improvement in student services and supports for international students as a result of increases in the differential fee last year, and queried the proposal to increase the differential by another 3% this year. He noted that students are thankful for the consultations that have taken place, but they are not happy with the proposed increases. He noted as well that undergraduate students are concerned about a perceived decrease in the quality of the educational experience at Dalhousie as a result of the recent non-replacement of faculty members and the issues around the library acquisitions budget.

Board members discussed some of these issues and proposed that BAC consider in its next cycle of deliberations a ceiling for students for the years they are at Dalhousie so that they can adequately plan for the costs they will face. There was also a question as to whether the University has a sense of where tuition rates and the differential fee should sit vis-a-vis the U15 group.

Moved by M. Awad, seconded by A. Palmetter:

##### Motion 1

**THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Operations Committee approve the 2014-15 tuition fees as presented in the tuition fee schedule for 2014-15 including:**

**a) A 3% general tuition fee increase applied to tuition fees for all programs and the international differential fee effective April 2014. Note that fees for students in MSc Occupational Therapy and Physiotherapy will be frozen at 2006-07 levels.**

**b) In addition to the general increase, a further increase of 2% be applied to tuition fees in the MD program each year for a four year period. These additional increases will apply beginning with students entering the Medicine program in the Fall of 2014.**

**c) In addition to the general increase, a further increase of 6% be applied to tuition fees in the DDS (including MD/MSc Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery) program each year for a four-year period. These additional increases will apply beginning with students entering the Dentistry program in the Fall of 2014.**

The motion CARRIED.

##### Motion 2

**THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Operations Committee, approve a 3% increase in the auxiliary fee for facilities renewal to \$81.90 per term for full time students effective April 2014.**

The motion CARRIED.

### **8.1.2 2014-15 Auxiliary Fees**

Moved by M. Awad, seconded by Barrie Black:

**THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Operations Committee, approved the Auxiliary fee changes for 2014-15 as presented.**

**The motion CARRIED.**

### **8.1.3 Student Services Fee**

Moved by M. Awad, seconded by A. Palmetter:

**THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Operations Committee, approve the 2014-15 Student Services fees as follows:**

**The Student Services fees for all Halifax campus students be increased by:**

- **\$11.05 per term for a full-time student,**
- **\$9.65 for a full-time summer student, and**
- **\$7.90 for part-time students in fall, winter and summer terms.**

**The Student Services fees for professional faculties on the Halifax campus be increased by \$22.10 per 8-month period for full-time students in Medicine and Dentistry.**

**The Student Services fees for the Agriculture campus students be increased by:**

- **\$3.80 per term for a full-time student,**
- **\$2.35 for a full-time summer student, and**
- **\$0.75 for part-time students in fall, winter and summer terms.**

**THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Operations Committee, approve the 2014-15 Student Health Fee special initiatives including:**

**For all full and part-time students:**

- **\$3.85 per student/per term for the Nurse Practitioner and enhanced programming support, and**
- **\$2.78 per student/per term for an additional personal counsellor/psychologist with a focus on international student support.**

**For full-time Medicine and Dentistry students:**

- **\$7.70 per 8-month term for the Nurse Practitioner and enhanced programming support, and**
- **\$5.56 per 8-month term for an additional personal counsellor/psychologist with a focus on international student support.**

**The motion CARRIED.**

### **8.1.4 Residence and Food Service Fees**

Moved by A. Palmetter, seconded by B. Black:

**THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Operations Committee, approve the 2014-15 residence room and meal plan rate schedule as presented.**

**The motion CARRIED.**

### **8.1.5 Student Referendum Fee Proposals**

Board members agreed to deal with the six motions together.

Moved by A. Palmeter, Seconded by R. Aziz:

#### **1. Equity and Accessibility Office Fees**

**THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Operations Committee, approve the implementation of a new fee of \$1.00 per full-time student, per semester and \$0.50 per part-time student, per semester on the Halifax campus.**

#### **2. Dalhousie Gazette Levy**

**THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Operations Committee, approve the fee increase of \$0.60 per full-time and part-time students, per semester on the Halifax campus for the Dalhousie Gazette Publishing Society.**

#### **3. Dalhousie Bike Centre Levy**

**THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Operations Committee, approve the implementation of a new Dalhousie Bike Centre levy of \$0.50 per full-time student, per semester on the Halifax campus.**

#### **4. Dalhousie Urban Gardening Society Levy**

**THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Operations Committee, approve the new 2014-15 Dalhousie Urban Gardening Society levy of \$0.50 per full-time student, per fall/winter semesters on the Halifax campus.**

#### **5. Dalhousie Campus Medical Response Team Levy**

**THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Operations Committee, approve a new levy of \$1.00 per full-time student, per fall/winter semesters on the Halifax campus to establish and fund the Dalhousie Medical Campus Response Team.**

#### **6. South House Levy**

**THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Operations Committee, approve the levy increase of \$1.43 per full-time student per fall/winter semester on the Halifax campus and an increase of \$0.83 per part-time student per fall/winter semester on the Halifax campus for the 2014-15 academic year only.**

**The motions CARRIED.**

### **8.1.6 Metro Transit U-Pass Fee Increase**

A. Palmeter noted that the increase presented is in accordance with the agreement between Dalhousie and Metro Transit.

Moved by A. Palmeter, seconded by Barrie Black:

**THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Operations Committee, approve the 2014-15 U-Pass fee of \$147.00 for full-time (fall/winter) students (pro-rated to \$73.50 for the winter and summer terms), effective for the Fall term 2014.**

**The motion CARRIED.**

## **8.2 External Debt Policy**

A. Palmeto spoke briefly to the development of this draft policy over the past several months and the feedback provided by both the Operations Committee and the Capital Projects and Facilities Committee as the document was developed. Following this, I. Nason responded to a question on Dalhousie's current debt status, noting that the University is well below the "amber zone" outlined in the policy, with sufficient capacity for other capital projects coming forward as priorities, if this is desirable. He also provided some clarification on the metrics used in the policy and how these were determined to be the appropriate measures. A further question raised the issue of whether, in the weighting of factors, there should be some sensitivity to the length of term of the debt. I. Nason and R. Florizone responded that, in practice, this really comes into play in the consideration of a multi-year plan. I. Nason noted that the intention is to prepare an annual report for the Board which will indicate exactly where the University sits in terms of debt and where it plans to go in future. This will be part of the consideration for each project the University proposes to bring forward. Members expressed that they were pleased to see the development of this policy.

Moved by A. Palmeto, seconded by Barrie Black:

**THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Operations Committee, approve the External Debt Policy as presented.**

**The motion CARRIED.**

## **Capital Projects and Facilities**

### **8.3 Fitness Centre Project**

W. Fares outlined the discussion of this issue by the Capital Projects and Facilities Committee and the recommendation presented. Following this introduction, he responded to several questions respecting the additional \$100,000 in funding requested for completion of schematic design work and the reasons for this.

Moved by W. Fares, seconded by J. Abbass:

**THAT the Board of Governors, on the recommendation of the Capital Projects and Facilities Committee, approve an increase in the fitness project planning and design budget of \$100k to \$1.1M to allow for the completion of the schematic design work for the new South Street Fitness Centre (\$23M), Sexton Campus Fitness Facility expansion/renewal (\$2M) and Dalplex fieldhouse floor renewal (\$1M) based on a total project budget of \$26M.**

**The motion CARRIED.**

There was a question regarding whether any consultation required over the summer would limit the involvement of students (as many are away from campus over this period). Staff responded that the project development committee for this project has two student representatives and that students have been well-represented throughout the process.

## **9. Items for Information**



### **9.1 Board Standing Committee Reports**

J. Spatz referred members to the committee reports included in the meeting package. C. Smith, Chair of the Audit Committee, highlighted briefly the summaries in the Audit Committee report on the annual report provided by the Office of Environmental Health and Safety, and the update on the Aquatron facility.

### **10. *In Camera* Session**

The Board moved to an *in camera* session.

### **11. Adjournment**

The meeting adjourned at 6:15 p.m.